



UNITED STATES PATENT AND TRADEMARK OFFICE

UNITED STATES DEPARTMENT OF COMMERCE
United States Patent and Trademark Office
Address: COMMISSIONER FOR PATENTS
P.O. Box 1450
Alexandria, Virginia 22313-1450
www.uspto.gov

APPLICATION NO.	FILING DATE	FIRST NAMED INVENTOR	ATTORNEY DOCKET NO.	CONFIRMATION NO.
10/612,445	07/02/2003	Katarina Magnusson	SG 03197	5438
44012	7590	11/18/2005	EXAMINER	
WHITE, REDWAY & BROWN LLP 1217 KING STREET ALEXANDRIA, VA 22314			MIGGINS, MICHAEL C	
			ART UNIT	PAPER NUMBER
			1772	
DATE MAILED: 11/18/2005				

Please find below and/or attached an Office communication concerning this application or proceeding.

Office Action Summary

Application No.

10/612,445

Applicant(s)

MAGNUSSON, KATARINA

Examiner

Michael C. Miggins

Art Unit

1772

-- The MAILING DATE of this communication appears on the cover sheet with the correspondence address --
Period for Reply

A SHORTENED STATUTORY PERIOD FOR REPLY IS SET TO EXPIRE 3 MONTH(S) OR THIRTY (30) DAYS, WHICHEVER IS LONGER, FROM THE MAILING DATE OF THIS COMMUNICATION.

- Extensions of time may be available under the provisions of 37 CFR 1.136(a). In no event, however, may a reply be timely filed after SIX (6) MONTHS from the mailing date of this communication.
- If NO period for reply is specified above, the maximum statutory period will apply and will expire SIX (6) MONTHS from the mailing date of this communication.
- Failure to reply within the set or extended period for reply will, by statute, cause the application to become ABANDONED (35 U.S.C. § 133). Any reply received by the Office later than three months after the mailing date of this communication, even if timely filed, may reduce any earned patent term adjustment. See 37 CFR 1.704(b).

Status

- 1) ☒ Responsive to communication(s) filed on 29 August 2005.
- 2a) ☐ This action is **FINAL**. 2b) ☒ This action is non-final.
- 3) ☐ Since this application is in condition for allowance except for formal matters, prosecution as to the merits is closed in accordance with the practice under *Ex parte Quayle*, 1935 C.D. 11, 453 O.G. 213.

Disposition of Claims

- 4) ☒ Claim(s) 15-26 is/are pending in the application.
- 4a) Of the above claim(s) _____ is/are withdrawn from consideration.
- 5) ☐ Claim(s) _____ is/are allowed.
- 6) ☒ Claim(s) 15-26 is/are rejected.
- 7) ☐ Claim(s) _____ is/are objected to.
- 8) ☐ Claim(s) _____ are subject to restriction and/or election requirement.

Application Papers

- 9) ☐ The specification is objected to by the Examiner.
- 10) ☐ The drawing(s) filed on _____ is/are: a) ☐ accepted or b) ☐ objected to by the Examiner.
Applicant may not request that any objection to the drawing(s) be held in abeyance. See 37 CFR 1.85(a).
Replacement drawing sheet(s) including the correction is required if the drawing(s) is objected to. See 37 CFR 1.121(d).
- 11) ☐ The oath or declaration is objected to by the Examiner. Note the attached Office Action or form PTO-152.

Priority under 35 U.S.C. § 119

- 12) ☐ Acknowledgment is made of a claim for foreign priority under 35 U.S.C. § 119(a)-(d) or (f).
- a) ☐ All b) ☐ Some * c) ☐ None of:
- ☐ Certified copies of the priority documents have been received.
 - ☐ Certified copies of the priority documents have been received in Application No. _____.
 - ☐ Copies of the certified copies of the priority documents have been received in this National Stage application from the International Bureau (PCT Rule 17.2(a)).

* See the attached detailed Office action for a list of the certified copies not received.

Attachment(s)

- | | |
|--|---|
| 1) <input type="checkbox"/> Notice of References Cited (PTO-892) | 4) <input type="checkbox"/> Interview Summary (PTO-413)
Paper No(s)/Mail Date. _____ |
| 2) <input type="checkbox"/> Notice of Draftsperson's Patent Drawing Review (PTO-948) | 5) <input type="checkbox"/> Notice of Informal Patent Application (PTO-152) |
| 3) <input type="checkbox"/> Information Disclosure Statement(s) (PTO-1449 or PTO/SB/08)
Paper No(s)/Mail Date _____ | 6) <input type="checkbox"/> Other: _____ |

DETAILED ACTION

Continued Examination Under 37 CFR 1.114

1. A request for continued examination under 37 CFR 1.114, including the fee set forth in 37 CFR 1.17(e), was filed in this application after final rejection. Since this application is eligible for continued examination under 37 CFR 1.114, and the fee set forth in 37 CFR 1.17(e) has been timely paid, the finality of the previous Office action has been withdrawn pursuant to 37 CFR 1.114. Applicant's submission filed on 8/29/05 has been entered.

REJECTIONS WITHDRAWN

2. There are no rejections withdrawn.

REJECTIONS REPEATED

3. All of the 35 USC 103(a) rejections set forth in the final rejection of 3/29/05, pages 2-4, paragraphs 5-7 are repeated for the reasons of record. Applicant has amended claim 15 to recite heating between about 90 and 121 degrees C. However, such a temperature range is necessarily present in the sterilization disclosed in JP '950 because it discloses a retort sterilization process and 90 to 121 degrees C is a conventional range for a retort sterilization. Furthermore, optimization of ranges of a result effective variable is obvious and well within the level of one of ordinary skill in the art (MPEP 2144). It would have been obvious to have provided applicant's claimed range in order to provide improved sterilization of the food package.

NEW REJECTIONS

4. There are no new rejections.

ANSWERS TO APPLICANT'S ARGUMENTS

5. Applicant's arguments filed 8/29/05 have been carefully considered but are deemed unpersuasive.

Applicant has argued that neither reference is directed to maintaining dimensional stability and mechanical strength of a container subject to retorting temperatures. However, applicant recites in claim 15 "while simultaneously retaining a *level* of dimensional stability and mechanical strength" it is not clear what "a level" refers too, applicant does not recite in the claims how much dimensional stability and mechanical strength is retained. It is certain that JP '950 retains *a certain level* of dimensional stability and mechanical strength during the retort sterilization process since the package would be useless for storing food if the package were completely destroyed during the retort sterilization process.

Applicant has argued that Koskinieme and JP '950 are inconsistent since Koskinieme discloses fiber based packaging materials and JP '950 discloses an ethylene vinyl alcohol core layer. However, it is not inconceivable to use fiber based packaging materials with ethylene vinyl alcohol in a multilayer packaging material since both materials are well known in the packaging industry.

In response to applicant's argument that Koskeniemi and JP '950 are inconsistent, the test for obviousness is not whether the features of a secondary reference may be bodily incorporated into the structure of the primary reference; nor is it that the claimed invention must be expressly suggested in any one or all of the references. Rather, the test is what the combined teachings of the references would have suggested to those of ordinary skill in the art. See *In re Keller*, 642 F.2d 413, 208 USPQ 871 (CCPA 1981).

Conclusion

Any inquiry concerning this communication or earlier communications from the examiner should be directed to Michael C. Miggins whose telephone number is 571-272-1494. The examiner can normally be reached on 1:00-10:00pm.

If attempts to reach the examiner by telephone are unsuccessful, the examiner's supervisor, Harold Y. Pyon can be reached on 571-272-1498. The fax phone number for the organization where this application or proceeding is assigned is 571-273-8300.

Information regarding the status of an application may be obtained from the Patent Application Information Retrieval (PAIR) system. Status information for published applications may be obtained from either Private PAIR or Public PAIR. Status information for unpublished applications is available through Private PAIR only. For more information about the PAIR system, see <http://pair-direct.uspto.gov>. Should you have questions on access to the Private PAIR system, contact the Electronic Business Center (EBC) at 866-217-9197 (toll-free).

Application/Control Number: 10/612,445
Art Unit: 1772

Page 5

MCM
November 11, 2005

Michael C. Miggins
Primary Examiner
Art Unit 1772

A handwritten signature in black ink, appearing to read "Michael C. Miggins", with a stylized flourish at the end.